

**PHIL 451 (2019-20 Term 2). Philosophy of Mind. Credits: 3**

**Prerequisites:** Either (a) [PHIL 240](#) or (b) [COGS 200](#). (If [COGS 200](#), accompanied by 3 credits of PHIL at the 200-level or above.)

**Professor Evan Thompson.** [evan.thompson@ubc.ca](mailto:evan.thompson@ubc.ca)

This Course Will Be Delivered Asynchronously Through Canvas.

Virtual office hours will be held via Zoom (announced through Canvas). Information will be announced at the beginning of the course.

UBC's Point Grey Campus is located on the traditional, ancestral, and unceded territory of the xwməθkwəyəm (Musqueam) people. The land it is situated on has always been a place of learning for the Musqueam people, who for millennia have passed on their culture, history, and traditions from one generation to the next on this site.

UBC provides resources to support student learning and to maintain healthy lifestyles but recognizes that sometimes crises arise and so there are additional resources to access including those for survivors of sexual violence. UBC values respect for the person and ideas of all members of the academic community. Harassment and discrimination are not tolerated nor is suppression of academic freedom. UBC provides appropriate accommodation for students with disabilities and for religious observances. UBC values academic honesty and students are expected to acknowledge the ideas generated by others and to uphold the highest academic standards in all of their actions. Details of the policies and how to access support are available on [the UBC Senate website](#).

**THIS COURSE WILL BE DELIVERED ASYNCHRONOUSLY THROUGH CANVAS.** This means that there are no scheduled class meetings. Instead, the content will consist of remotely delivered modules, each of which will include reading assignments and video lectures by me. We will use the Discussions tool in Canvas for discussion about the class content. Participating in the Canvas discussions is optional.

*During this pandemic, the shift to online learning has greatly altered teaching and studying at UBC, including changes to health and safety considerations. Keep in mind that some UBC courses might cover topics that are censored or considered illegal by non-Canadian governments. This may include, but is not limited to, human rights, representative government, defamation, obscenity, gender or sexuality, and historical or current geopolitical controversies. If you are a student living abroad, you will be subject to the laws of your local jurisdiction, and your local authorities might limit your access to course material or take punitive action against you. UBC is strongly committed to academic freedom, but has no control over foreign authorities (please visit <http://www.calendar.ubc.ca/vancouver/index.cfm?tree=3,33,86,0> for an articulation of the values of the University conveyed in the Senate Statement on Academic Freedom). Thus, we recognize that students will have legitimate reason to exercise caution in studying certain subjects. If you have concerns regarding your personal situation, consider postponing taking a course with manifest risks, until you are back on campus or reach out to your academic advisor to find substitute courses. For further information and support, please visit: <http://academic.ubc.ca/support-resources/freedom-expression>*

## Description

This course is an advanced introduction to the philosophy of mind. Its objective is to introduce you to a variety of philosophical issues about the nature of the mind, especially issues that arise in connection with scientific research on the brain.

The course will focus on the nature of consciousness and the self. What is consciousness and how is it related to the brain, the rest of the body, and the physical world? Can consciousness be explained in physical terms? Can there be a scientific understanding of consciousness or will consciousness remain forever mysterious? Is there a self or is the self an illusion? Guided by these questions, we will examine consciousness and the sense of self across a wide variety of states, including awake perception, dreaming, lucid dreaming, deep sleep, out-of-body experiences, dying and near-death experiences, as well as meditative states.

We will draw from a wide variety of sources, including contemporary philosophy of mind, Indian philosophy, and Buddhist philosophy, as well as cognitive science, especially the neuroscience of consciousness, sleep science, and the neuroscience of meditation.

Upon successful completion of the course, you will have a broad comprehensive knowledge of both scientific findings and philosophical positions about the nature of consciousness and the self, along with philosophical tools for analyzing scientific research on the mind and body.

## Readings

Evan Thompson, *Waking, Dreaming, Being: Self and Consciousness in Neuroscience, Meditation, and Philosophy*. Available online at the UBC Library:

<https://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/ubc/detail.action?docID=1801744>

Electronic and hard copy editions available at amazon.com, amazon.ca, chapters.indigo.ca, iTunes, barnesandnoble.com

Additional readings will be available online, through the UBC library, or at Canvas.

## Requirements

- Weekly reading assignments and lecture videos about them.
- Three reflective papers, 1500 words, responding to assigned prompts. Each paper is worth 1/3 of your final grade. Information with due dates will be posted in Canvas.

**Statement on Plagiarism:** Plagiarism is intellectual theft and occurs when you submit or present the oral or written work of another person as your own. Scholarship rests on examining and referring to the thoughts and writings of others. When another person's words (i.e., phrases, sentences, or paragraphs), ideas, or entire works are used, the author must be acknowledged in the text, in footnotes, endnotes, or another accepted form of academic citation. Where direct quotations are made, they must be clearly delineated (for example, within quotation marks or separately indented). Failure to provide proper attribution is plagiarism because it represents someone else's work as one's own. Plagiarism should not occur in submitted drafts or final works. A student who

seeks assistance from a tutor or other scholastic aids must ensure that the work submitted is the student's own. Students are responsible for ensuring that any work submitted does not constitute plagiarism. Students who are in any doubt as to what constitutes plagiarism should consult their instructor before handing in any assignments. For further information, please see the following link about academic misconduct:

<http://www.calendar.ubc.ca/Vancouver/index.cfm?tree=3,54,111,959>

**PLAGIARISM WILL NOT BE TOLERATED AND WILL RESULT IN AN AUTOMATIC FAILURE OF THE QUIZ OR PAPER**, as well as possible further disciplinary action by the University.

### **Email Policy**

The following guidelines apply to email communication during this course:

- I will make every effort to reply to legitimate email inquiries within 24 hours during weekdays but will likely take longer to respond to email during the weekend.
- Each email message should include in the Subject line the course identifier and a clear statement of purpose (e.g., PHIL 491: Question about Paper); otherwise, it may be deleted along with spam messages.

### **Copyright**

All materials of this course (course readings, lecture slides, handouts, etc.) are the intellectual property of the course instructor or licensed to be used in this course by the copyright owner. Redistribution of these materials by any means without permission of the copyright holder(s) constitutes a breach of copyright and may lead to academic discipline.

## OUTLINE

The course content is divided into the following 11 Modules:

- (1) Introduction
- (2) The Problem of Consciousness
- (3) Consciousness and the Brain
- (4) The Cognitive Science of Meditation
- (5) The Stream of Consciousness
- (6) Dreaming and Lucid Dreaming
- (7) Out-of-Body Experiences (OBEs)
- (8) Dreamless Sleep
- (9) The Self
- (10) Death
- (11) Pure Awareness

There is a total of 21 lectures (in the form of video/audio files with corresponding slide files) organized as follows:

### Module 1: Introduction

- Lecture 1: Introduction
- Lecture 2: What is Consciousness?
- Lecture 3: Looking for Awareness

### Module 2: The Problem of Consciousness

- Lecture 4: The Hard Problem of Consciousness
- Lecture 5: Illusionism: Could Consciousness Be an Illusion?

### Module 3: Consciousness and the Brain

- Lecture 6: Scientific Theories of Consciousness: Sensory Versus Cognitive Theories
- Lecture 7: Scientific Theories of Consciousness: The Integrated Information Theory of Consciousness

### Module 4: The Cognitive Science of Meditation

- Lecture 8: The Cognitive Science of Meditation

### Module 5: The Stream of Consciousness

- Lecture 9: Is Consciousness Continuous or Discrete?
- Lecture 10: Mind Wandering and Spontaneous Thought

### Module 6: Dreaming and Lucid Dreaming

- Lecture 11: The Dream State
- Lecture 12: Lucid Dreaming
- Lecture 13: Is Dreaming Hallucination or Imagination?

Module 7: Out-of-Body Experiences

Lecture 14: Out-of-Body Experiences

Module 8: Dreamless Sleep

Lecture 15: Does Consciousness Disappear in Dreamless Sleep?

Module 9: The Self

Lecture 16: Is the Self an Illusion?

Module 10: Death

Lecture 17: What is Death?

Lecture 18: Near-Death Experiences (NDEs)

Module 11: Pure Awareness

Lecture 19: Minimal Phenomenal Experience

Lecture 20: Panpsychism

Lecture 21: The Primacy of Consciousness

The exact weekly schedule will be announced on Canvas. See below for the lecture schedule and readings.

## LECTURES WITH READINGS

Readings marked with an asterisk (\*) are the ones you should try to do. The others inside the boxes are supplementary readings that I will use in the lectures and that you can consult when you write your papers.

### MODULE 1: INTRODUCTION

#### Lecture 1: Introduction

\*WDB, Prologue, Introduction,

#### Lecture 2: What is Consciousness?

\*WDB, Chapter 1.

#### Lecture 3: Looking for Awareness

\*Brentyn J. Ramm, "Pure awareness experience," <https://www-tandfonline-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/doi/full/10.1080/0020174X.2019.1592704>

### MODULE 2: THE PROBLEM OF CONSCIOUSNESS

#### Lecture 4: The Hard Problem of Consciousness

\*David Chalmers, "Facing Up to the Problem of Consciousness," <http://consc.net/papers/facing.html>

\*Frank Jackson, "What Mary Didn't Know," [https://www-jstor-org.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/stable/2026143?seq=1#metadata\\_info\\_tab\\_contents](https://www-jstor-org.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/stable/2026143?seq=1#metadata_info_tab_contents)

\*Thomas Nagel, "What Is It Like to Be a Bat?" [https://www-jstor-org.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/stable/2183914?origin=JSTOR-pdf&seq=1#metadata\\_info\\_tab\\_contents](https://www-jstor-org.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/stable/2183914?origin=JSTOR-pdf&seq=1#metadata_info_tab_contents)

#### Lecture 5: Illusionism: Could Consciousness Be an Illusion?

\*Keith Frankish, "The Consciousness Illusion," at <https://aeon.co/essays/what-if-your-consciousness-is-an-illusion-created-by-your-brain>

\*Jay Garfield, "Illusionism and Givenness," <https://www-ingentaconnect-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/contentone/imp/jcs/2016/00000023/f0020011/art00006?crawler=true>

Susan Blackmore, "Delusions of Consciousness," <https://www.susanblackmore.uk/wp-content/uploads/2017/05/2016jcs.pdf>

Daniel C. Dennett, "Facing Up to the Hard Question of Consciousness," <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC6074080/>

Keith Frankish, "Illusionism as a Theory of Consciousness," [https://nbviewer.jupyter.org/github/k0711/kf\\_articles/blob/master/Frankish\\_Illusionism%20as%20a%20theory%20of%20consciousness\\_eprint.pdf](https://nbviewer.jupyter.org/github/k0711/kf_articles/blob/master/Frankish_Illusionism%20as%20a%20theory%20of%20consciousness_eprint.pdf)

Galen Strawson, "The Consciousness Deniers," at <https://www-nybooks-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/daily/2018/03/13/the-consciousness-deniers/>

Daniel C. Dennett, reply by Galen Strawson, “‘Magic, Illusion, and Zombies’: An Exchange,” at <https://www.nybooks-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/daily/2018/04/03/magic-illusions-and-zombies-an-exchange/>

Massimo Pigliucci, “Consciousness is Real,” [https://aeon.co/essays/consciousness-is-neither-a-spooky-mystery-nor-an-illusory-belief?utm\\_source=Aeon+Newsletter&utm\\_medium=email&utm\\_campaign=december\\_drive\\_2019](https://aeon.co/essays/consciousness-is-neither-a-spooky-mystery-nor-an-illusory-belief?utm_source=Aeon+Newsletter&utm_medium=email&utm_campaign=december_drive_2019)

### MODULE 3: CONSCIOUSNESS AND THE BRAIN

#### Lecture 6: Scientific Theories of Consciousness: Sensory Versus Cognitive Theories of Consciousness

\* Philip Ball, “Neuroscience Readies for a Show Down Over Consciousness Ideas,” <https://www.quantamagazine.org/neuroscience-readies-for-a-showdown-over-consciousness-ideas-20190306/>

\*Ned Block, “What is Wrong with the No-Report Paradigm and How to Fix It,” <https://www.sciencedirect-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/science/article/pii/S1364661319302360?via%3Dihub>

\*Michael A. Cohen and Daniel C. Dennett, “Consciousness Cannot Be Separated from Function,” <https://www.sciencedirect-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/science/article/pii/S1364661311001252>

Ned Block, “Two Neural Correlates of Consciousness,” [http://www.nyu.edu/gsas/dept/philo/faculty/block/papers/final\\_revised\\_proof.pdf](http://www.nyu.edu/gsas/dept/philo/faculty/block/papers/final_revised_proof.pdf)

Melanie Boly et al., “Are the Neural Correlates of Consciousness in the Front or in the Back of the Cerebral Cortex? Clinical and Neuroimaging Evidence,” [https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/da78/d9150560ea8ad35959f3aab5d733efc99a93.pdf?\\_ga=2.209666578.1024787130.1573148730-1804964222.1573148730](https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/da78/d9150560ea8ad35959f3aab5d733efc99a93.pdf?_ga=2.209666578.1024787130.1573148730-1804964222.1573148730)

Brian Odegaard et al., “Should a Few Null Findings Falsify Prefrontal Theories of Consciousness?” [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/320219640\\_Should\\_a\\_Few\\_Null\\_Findings\\_Falsify\\_Prefrontal\\_Theories\\_of\\_Conscious\\_Perception](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/320219640_Should_a_Few_Null_Findings_Falsify_Prefrontal_Theories_of_Conscious_Perception)

Nicholas Shea and Chris D. Frith, “The Global Workspace Needs Metacognition,” [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/333481520\\_The\\_Global\\_Workspace\\_Needs\\_Metacognition](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/333481520_The_Global_Workspace_Needs_Metacognition)

Victor Lamme, “The Crack of Dawn: Perceptual Functions and Neural Mechanisms that Mark the Transition from Unconscious Processing to Conscious Vision,” <https://open-mind.net/papers/the-crack-of-dawn-perceptual-functions-and-neural-mechanisms-that-mark-the-transition-from-unconscious-processing-to-conscious-vision>

### Lecture 7: The Integrated Information Theory of Consciousness.

\*Giulio Tononi and Christof Koch, "Consciousness: Here, There, and Everywhere?"

<https://royalsocietypublishing.org/doi/pdf/10.1098/rstb.2014.0167>

\*Tim Bayne, "On the Axiomatic Foundations of the Integrated Information Theory of Consciousness,"

<https://academic-oup-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/nc/article/2018/1/niy007/5047367>

Giulio Tononi et al., "Integrated Information Theory: From Consciousness to Its Physical Substrate,"

[https://www.researchgate.net/publication/303551101\\_Integrated\\_information\\_theory\\_From\\_consciousness\\_to\\_its\\_physical\\_substrate](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/303551101_Integrated_information_theory_From_consciousness_to_its_physical_substrate)

Scott Aaronson, "Why I Am Not an Integrated Information Theorist (or, The Unconscious Expander),"

<https://www.scottaaronson.com/blog/?p=1799>

Adam Pautz, "What is the Integrated Information Theory of Consciousness: A Catalogue of Questions,"

<https://philpapers.org/archive/PAUWIT-2.pdf>

Anthony Peressini, "Consciousness as Integrated Information: A Provisional Philosophical Critique,"

<https://www-ingentaconnect-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/content/imp/jcs/2013/00000020/F0020001/art00010>

John R. Searle, "Can Information Theory Explain Consciousness?"

<https://www-nybooks-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/articles/2013/01/10/can-information-theory-explain-consciousness/>

## MODULE 4: THE COGNITIVE SCIENCE OF MEDITATION

### Lecture 8: The Cognitive Science of Meditation

\*Antoine Lutz et al., "Investigating the Phenomenological Matrix of Mindfulness-Related Practices from a Neurocognitive Perspective,"

<https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/26436313>

## MODULE 5: THE STREAM OF CONSCIOUSNESS

### Lecture 9: Is Consciousness Continuous or Discrete?

\*WDB, Chapter 2.

Evan Thompson, "Is Consciousness a Stream?" at

<http://philosophyofbrains.com/2015/07/29/is-consciousness-a-stream.aspx>

Evan Thompson, "Is Consciousness a Stream? An Update," at

<https://www.psychologytoday.com/blog/waking-dreaming-being/201509/is-consciousness-stream-update>

Ruffin VanRullen and Christof Koch, "Is Perception Discrete or Continuous?"

<https://www-sciencedirect-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/science/article/pii/S1364661303000950?via%3Dihub>

Ruffin VanRullen, "Perceptual Cycles,"

<https://www-sciencedirect-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/science/article/pii/S1364661316301048?via%3Dihub>



Peter A. White, "Is Conscious Perception a Series of Discrete Temporal Frames?"

<https://www-sciencedirect-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/science/article/pii/S1053810018300047?via%3Dihub>

Michael Herzog et al., "All in Good Time: Long-Lasting Postdictive Effects Reveal Discrete Perception," <https://www-sciencedirect-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/science/article/pii/S1364661320301704?via%3Dihub>

### Lecture 10: Mind Wandering and Spontaneous Thought

\*Kalina Christoff et al., "Mind-Wandering as Spontaneous Thought: A Dynamic Framework," at <http://www.christofflab.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/Christoff2016-NRN.pdf>

Zachary Irving and Evan Thompson, "The Philosophy of Mind-Wandering," at

<https://www-oxfordhandbooks-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/view/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780190464745.001.0001/oxfordhb-9780190464745-e-19>

Melissa Ellamil et al., "Dynamics of Neural Recruitment Surrounding the Spontaneous Arising of Thoughts in Experienced Mindfulness Practitioners," at

<http://www.christofflab.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/Ellamil2016-STdynamics.pdf>

## MODULE 6: DREAMING AND LUCID DREAMING

### Lecture 11: The Dream State

\*WDB, Chapter 4.

### Lecture 12: Lucid Dreaming.

\*WDB, Chapter 5.

Daniel C. Dennett, "Are Dreams Experiences?"

<https://dl.tufts.edu/concern/pdfs/tm70n6786>

Kathleen Emmett, "Oneiric Experiences," [https://www-jstor-org.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/stable/4319268?seq=1#metadata\\_info\\_tab\\_contents](https://www-jstor-org.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/stable/4319268?seq=1#metadata_info_tab_contents)

Daniel C. Dennett, "The Onus Re Experiences: A Reply to Emmett,"

<https://dl.tufts.edu/concern/pdfs/Or967g49t>

Benjamin Baird, Sergio A. Mota-Rolim, and Martin Dresler, "The Cognitive Neuroscience of Lucid Dreaming," <https://www-sciencedirect-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/science/article/pii/S0149763418303361>

### Lecture 13: Is Dreaming Hallucination or Imagination?

\*WDB, Chapter 6.

Jonathan Ichikawa, "Dreaming and Imagination," <https://onlinelibrary-wiley-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/doi/full/10.1111/j.1468-0017.2008.01355.x>

Jennifer M. Windt, "The Immersive Spatiotemporal Hallucination Model of Dreaming,"  
<https://link-springer-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/article/10.1007/s11097-010-9163-1>

## MODULE 7: OUT-OF-BODY EXPERIENCES (OBEs)

### Lecture 14: Out-of-Body Experiences (OBEs)

\*WDB, Chapter 7.

## MODULE 8: DREAMLESS SLEEP

### Lecture 15: Does Consciousness Disappear in Dreamless Sleep?

\*WDB, Chapter 8.

Jennifer Windt, Tore Nielsen, and Evan Thompson, "Does Consciousness Disappear in Dreamless Sleep?" <https://evanthompsondotme.files.wordpress.com/2012/11/1-s2-0-s1364661316301528-main.pdf>

Evan Thompson, "Dreamless Sleep, the Embodied Mind, and Consciousness: The Relevance of a Classical Indian Debate to Cognitive Science," <https://open-mind.net/papers/dreamless-sleep-the-embodied-mind-and-consciousness-the-relevance-of-a-classical-indian-debate-to-cognitive-science>

## MODULE 9: THE SELF

### Lecture 16: Is the Self an Illusion?

\*WDB, Chapter 10.

Thomas Metzinger, "The No-Self Alternative,"  
[https://static1.squarespace.com/static/592b5bbfd482e9898c67fd98/t/5d17b3c432c2550001db9a7d/1561834437216/no-Self\\_metzinger.pdf](https://static1.squarespace.com/static/592b5bbfd482e9898c67fd98/t/5d17b3c432c2550001db9a7d/1561834437216/no-Self_metzinger.pdf)

## MODULE 10: DEATH

### Lecture 17: What is Death?

\*WDB, Chapter 9

Evan Thompson, "Death: The Ultimate Transformative Experience,"  
<https://evanthompsondotme.files.wordpress.com/2017/11/thompson-revised-death-the-ultimate-transformative-experience.pdf>

David DeGrazia, "The Definition of Death," *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*,  
<https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/death-definition/>

Steven Laureys, "Death, Unconsciousness, and the Brain," <https://www-nature-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/articles/nrn1789>

Steven Luper, "Death," *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*,  
<https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/death/>

Thomas Nagel, "Death," <http://dbanach.com/death.htm> or  
[http://faculty.arts.ubc.ca/maydede/mind/Nagel\\_Death.pdf](http://faculty.arts.ubc.ca/maydede/mind/Nagel_Death.pdf)

### Lecture 18: Near-Death Experiences (NDEs)

\*WDB, Chapter 9, pp. 299-314

Benjamin Mitchell-Yellin and John Martin Fischer, "The Near-Death Experience Argument Against Physicalism," <https://www-ingentaconnect-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/contentone/imp/jcs/2014/00000021/F0020007/art00008>

## MODULE 11: PURE AWARENESS

### Lecture 19: Minimal Phenomenal Experience

\*Thomas Metzinger, "Minimal Phenomenal Experience,"  
[https://www.philosophie.fb05.uni-mainz.de/files/2019/04/MPE\\_discussion\\_paper\\_March\\_2019.pdf](https://www.philosophie.fb05.uni-mainz.de/files/2019/04/MPE_discussion_paper_March_2019.pdf)

### Lecture 20: Panpsychism

\*Galen Strawson, "Realistic Monism: Why Physicalism Entails Panpsychism"

Michel Bitbol, "Panpsychism in the First Person," [http://michel.bitbol.pagesperso-orange.fr/PanPsy\\_Pheno\\_Kirchberg\\_Short\\_CF.pdf](http://michel.bitbol.pagesperso-orange.fr/PanPsy_Pheno_Kirchberg_Short_CF.pdf)

Greg Rosenberg, "Land Ho? We Are Close to a Synoptic Understanding of Consciousness," <https://www-oxfordscholarship-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/view/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199359943.001.0001/acprof-9780199359943-chapter-7>

### Lecture 21: The Primacy of Consciousness

\*WDB, Chapter 3.

Michel Bitbol, "Is Consciousness Primary?" <http://philsci-archive.pitt.edu/4007/1/ConsciousnessPrimaryArt2.pdf>

Adam Frank, Marcelo Gleiser, and Evan Thompson, "The Blind Spot,"  
<https://aeon.co/essays/the-blind-spot-of-science-is-the-neglect-of-lived-experience>

Piet Hut and Roger Shepard, "Turning the Hard Problem Upside Down and Sideways,"  
<https://www-ingentaconnect-com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/content/imp/jcs/1996/00000003/00000004/717>