

PHIL 540, Fall 2023
Tuesdays 2pm-5pm
Location: BUCH Phil grad seminar room

Professor: Cat Prueitt
Email: cprueitt@mail.ubc.ca
Office Hours: Tuesdays 11am-12:15pm in person in my office (Buchanan E378); Wednesdays 1:30pm-2:30pm via Zoom
Appointment only: no
Also by appointment: yes

PHIL 540: Subjects, Objects, and the Structure of Awareness

This course will serve as a graduate-level introduction to Classical Sanskrit epistemology by doing a deep dive into a synthetic and innovative tradition that flourished in Kashmir in the 9th-11th centuries. This tradition, called Pratyabhijñā, provides particularly brilliant answers to questions at the heart of Sanskrit epistemological debates. As sentient beings, we exist in worlds populated by objects and other subjects that appear to be entirely distinct from us. But what is it about the structure of awareness such that we're able to experience self, others, and objects as both distinct *and* part of the same world? Pratyabhijñā philosophers hold that we are able to experience our worlds as we do because our worlds are nothing but the play of divine consciousness manifesting itself in diverse forms. This may strike you as implausible, but these philosophers will argue that rational inquiry leads directly to their view. We'll explore their arguments by reading key primary texts in English translation.

This course also has a methodological aim. There are many philosophical traditions from around the world and throughout history that have been marginalized in contemporary Philosophy departments for historically contingent reasons. Because of this, when studies and translations of key works from these traditions do exist, they are often written for academics in different fields (particularly Religious Studies and Classics). The works that we will study are no exception. Our course will allow you to develop the skills to not be intimidated by works that are not written specifically for disciplinary Philosophers. These skills will be transferrable to work you may wish to do on other marginalized traditions.

Assignments and Grading Structure: All assignments will be submitted via Canvas. You do not have to submit physical copies of any assignments. Our assessment scale follows [UBC's standard grading policy](#).

1. Session Guide (15%)
 - a. Each of you will sign up to be a session guide for one week's materials. You'll be responsible for guiding the first hour of the class. In the beginning, you'll provide a brief overview of our week's readings. Then, you'll identify one major argument in the material. You'll either raise a critique or provide further

justification for this argument. It's likely that, during this time, background questions will come up. I'll answer small questions as needed, and I'll note bigger questions to address in the second hour or so of the class. Finally, we'll have a general discussion in the remaining time.

2. Book review on Nemec's translations of the *Śivadṛṣṭi*, Parts I and II (20%): 1500-2500 words; due Nov. 3rd at 11:59pm
 - a. This will be written in the style of a Notre Dame Philosophical Review. If you're inspired to do so, you may alternatively write this in the style of a critical essay from *MIND*. The *MIND* essays tend to be around 5000 words and include more substantial philosophical analysis. No preference will be given to either form; just write whichever is more interesting and useful to you.
3. Final paper (65%): 5000-7000 words; due Dec. 19th at 11:59pm

UBC's Academic Integrity Policies are in effect at all times in this class. I take plagiarism very seriously and there will be consequences, ranging from failing the assignment to being reported to UBC's Academic Misconduct Committee, if you do not properly cite any and all sources you use in your assignments. The use of ChatGPT and similar AI tools constitutes plagiarism in this class. For your reference, here is UBC's policy on plagiarism:

Plagiarism, which is intellectual theft, occurs where an individual submits or presents the oral or written work of another person as his or her own. Scholarship quite properly rests upon examining and referring to the thoughts and writings of others. However, when another person's words (i.e. phrases, sentences, or paragraphs), ideas, or entire works are used, the author must be acknowledged in the text, in footnotes, in endnotes, or in another accepted form of academic citation. Where direct quotations are made, they must be clearly delineated (for example, within quotation marks or separately indented). Failure to provide proper attribution is plagiarism because it represents someone else's work as one's own. Plagiarism should not occur in submitted drafts or final works. A student who seeks assistance from a tutor or other scholastic aids must ensure that the work submitted is the student's own. Students are responsible for ensuring that any work submitted does not constitute plagiarism. Students who are in any doubt as to what constitutes plagiarism should consult their instructor before handing in any assignments (<http://www.calendar.ubc.ca/Vancouver/index.cfm?tree=3,54,111,959>).

Statement of UBC Values and Resources: UBC provides resources to support student learning and to maintain healthy lifestyles but recognizes that sometimes crises arise and so there are additional resources to access including those for survivors of sexual violence. UBC values respect for the person and ideas of all members of the academic community. Harassment and discrimination are not tolerated nor is suppression of academic freedom. UBC provides appropriate accommodation for students with disabilities and for religious and cultural observances. UBC values academic honesty and students are expected to acknowledge the ideas generated by others and to uphold the highest academic standards in all of their actions. Details of the policies and how to access support are available at <https://senate.ubc.ca/policiesresources-support-student-success>

Late Policy

If you do not ask me for an extension, I will deduct 5% from the assignment grade for each day that the assignment is late. This is a hard and fast policy. If you would like an extension of up to 48 hours, *just ask*. Send me an email requesting a specific amount of additional time (for example, you could ask for an additional 24 hours). You can ask for the extension at 11:59pm the day the assignment is due if you need to; as long as you email me a request for a specific amount of additional time up to 48 hours, the request will be granted. **You do not need to give me an excuse or a justification. Please DO NOT send medical documentation or pictures.** I trust you, and I trust that if you're asking for an extension it's because you just need a little more time to produce your best work.

I will not grant any extension of more than 48 hours unless you file for a formal Academic Concession with the appropriate UBC office. Here's a link to UBC's guide to Academic Concessions for Arts Students: <https://www.arts.ubc.ca/degree-planning/academic-performance/academic-concession/>, **and here's the link for Sciences Students:** <https://science.ubc.ca/students/advising/concession>

The idea behind this two-tiered late policy (automatically granting short extensions if they're requested before the assignment is due but requiring long extensions to go through UBC's formal process) is that I know that there are many reasons why it might take longer than planned to produce high-quality intellectual work. An extension of 48 hours is unlikely to significantly affect your ability to keep up with the new work in the course, but if something longer than that is needed, there is a good chance that your ongoing work will be impacted. UBC has excellent resources for academic advising, and they can help you figure out a plan if there's a significant disruption. Please take advantage of these resources knowing that I will always follow whatever formal guidance they give us.

Required Texts: Most readings for this course will be available either as PDFs on Canvas or as eBooks through the UBC library (see the "Library Online Course Reserves (LOC)" tab for full books). Nemec's translation of the *Śivadr̥ṣṭi*, Parts I and II, are on LOC; the rest are PDFs. The only book that you will need to secure your own copy of is:

- Ratié, Isabelle. 2021. *Utpaladeva on the Power of Action: A First Edition, Annotated Translation, and Study of Īśvarapratyabhijñāvivṛti, Chapter 2.1*. Annotated edition. Cambridge: Harvard Oriental Series.

You can purchase this book either on amazon.ca (https://www.amazon.ca/Utpaladeva-Power-Action-Translation-Īśvarapratyabhijñāvivṛti/dp/0674270819/ref=sr_1_1?crid=2EM8CO5O4MPNI&keywords=Ratié+utpaladeva&qid=1691863642&srefix=ratié+utpaladeva%2Caps%2C176&sr=8-1) or via the Harvard Oriental Series website if it's sold out on Amazon: <https://www.hup.harvard.edu/catalog.php?isbn=9780674270817>. Going directly through the HOS site will be a bit slower, the price is in USD, and shipping is a bit expensive. I highly recommend that you order this book through one of these methods *right away*. We'll begin reading it for class on Oct. 10th.

Course Schedule

Part I: Somānanda's *Śivadr̥ṣṭi*

Week 1: (Sept. 12th): Introduction; sign up for session guide slots; orientational lecture from Cat

Week 2: (Sept. 19th): Nemec, *The Ubiquitous Śiva Part I*: Introduction and translation of Chapter One of the *Śivadr̥ṣṭi* and the *Śivadr̥ṣṭivṛtti*, p. 1-145. Focus on primarily on the translation and the section “Somānanda’s Settled Opinion” in the Introduction.

- Session Guide:

Week 3: (Sept. 26th): Nemec, *The Ubiquitous Śiva Part I*, translation of Chapters Two and Three of the *Śivadr̥ṣṭi* and the *Śivadr̥ṣṭivṛtti*, p. 146-272 (focus on Chapter 3)

- Session Guide:

Week 4 (Oct. 3rd): Nemec, *The Ubiquitous Śiva Part II*, Introduction and translation (p. 3-179, but skip the part about the edition in the Intro)

- Session Guide:

start working on your book review after class this week

Part II: Utpaladeva's *Īśvarapratyabhijñākārikāvṛtti* (note that Torella's translation is provided as a single continuous PDF on Canvas)

Week 5 (Oct. 10th): For intro context, Ratié, *Utpaladeva on the Power of Action*, Chapter 3 (p. 81-100); skim Torella's Introduction, and focus on Torella's translation of Utpaladeva, ĪPKV Section 1: Knowledge, p. 85-152

- Session Guide:

Week 6 (Oct. 17th): Ratié on ĪPKVi Section 2.1.1-2.1.5: Action (in *Utpaladeva on the Power of Action*, p. 101-246 and the translations of the corresponding sections, p. 303-331)

- Session Guide:

Week 7 (Oct. 24th): Ratié on ĪPKVi Section 2.1.6-2.1.8: Action (in *Utpaladeva on the Power of Action*, p. 247-302 and the translations of the corresponding sections, p. 319-340);

- Session Guide:

Week 8 (Oct. 31st): Torella's translation of the remainder of the ĪPKV (the rest of Section II, along with Sections III and IV), p. 161-219; Hanneder's Introduction to the MŚV Part I, p. 1-32 and his translation of Abhinavagupta's verses 1-399, p. 59-123 (English side only; PDF provided on Canvas)

- Session Guide:

Book review due on Friday, Nov. 3rd via Canvas

Part III: Abhinavagupta's Aesthetics

Week 9 (Nov. 7th): Reich, *To Savor the Meaning*, Introduction, Chapter 1, and Chapter 3 (PDFs on Canvas); selections from the *Abhinavabhāratī* (PDFs on Canvas)

- Session Guide:

No class on Tuesday, November 14th

Week 10 (Nov. 21st): Selections from the *Dhvanyālokalocaṇa*, first chunk (PDF on Canvas)

- Session Guide:

Week 11 (Nov. 28th): Selections from the *Dhvanyālokalocaṇa*, second chunk (PDF on Canvas)

- Session Guide:

Week 12: (Dec. 5th): Last day of class; final paper topic and provisional argument presentations

Final paper due at 11:59pm via Canvas on Tuesday, December 19th